



TRANSMITTED

Asim
28-6-18

FAX

Page 1 of 23

| | |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------|
| To: ✓ Prem Chand Talreja Project Director, Project Management Unit Sindh Provincial Road Improvement Project, Hyderabad | Date: 26 June 2018 Fax: 022-9201230 |
| Originator: <i>[Signature]</i> Khurram Imtiaz Butt Associate Portfolio Management Officer | Endorsed: Zheng Wu Head, PAU, PRM <i>[Signature]</i> |

**Subject: Loan 3305-PAK: Sindh Provincial Road Improvement Project (SPRIP)
Consulting Services for Preparation of Sindh Road Network Master Plan, including
Institutional Strengthening Trainings – Approval of Submission-3**

Dear Mr. Talreja,

This refers to your 1st request for review of Submission-3 regarding the recruitment of Consulting Services for the preparation of Sindh Road Network Master Plan, including Institutional Strengthening Trainings, received on 11 June 2018 for our review and endorsement. ADB received the revised Financial Evaluation Form-7 of technical proposal from Project Management Unit (PMU) on 20 June 2018.

After review, ADB accords approval of Submission-3. Please proceed with the contract negotiations with the first ranked firm M/s Engineering Consultants International (Pvt) Ltd.

Please note that (i) before proceeding with contract negotiations, the consulting firm needs to confirm the availability of all team members nominated in its proposal as a pre-requisite to the negotiation; (ii) submit the CVs that are signed by the experts themselves; (iii) replacing personnel may be considered when the proposed team become unavailable due to reasons beyond the firm's control (for example illness, death, or family difficulties); and (iv) replacement must have equal or better qualification and experience than the original expert.

The PMU requests replacement of personnel if an expert has received a low score, is ineligible or was rated poorly for a previous consulting assignment. The remuneration charged for the replacement expert should remain the same as that proposed for the original expert.

The firm invited to negotiate shall submit to PMU a letter of authority identifying the firm's representative who shall be authorized to negotiate and sign the contract, as well as a copy of the firm's legal certificate of incorporation of establishment.

The PMU shall include the following agenda items in its invitation letter to the consulting firm.

1. submitting written authorization for the consultant to negotiate and sign a contract with PMU;




PAKISTAN RESIDENT MISSION
Level 8, North Wing, Serena Business Complex
Khayaban-e-Sulhawardy, G-5
Islamabad, Pakistan
Tel +92 51 260 0351-69
Fax +92 51 260 0365-66
www.adb.org/pakistan

FAX

- ii. reviewing documentation submitted, including the financial proposals, review of project matters such as, scope of work/TOR, work plan and personnel schedule, counterpart staff and facilities, and/or equipment
- iii. reviewing the financial terms and conditions;
- iv. reviewing the consultant's contract;
- v. explaining the post-assignment questionnaire; and
- vi. Discussing contract administration and monthly progress reports.

Sincerely,



Xiaphong Yang
Country Director

Attachment: Updated Consultant Recruitment Activity Monitoring (CRAM) sheet.

cc: ✓ Secretary, Works and Services Department, Karachi.

KB/iq

ASIAN DEVELOPMENT BANK
SUMMARY PROPOSAL RANKING SHEET

LOAN 3305-PAK: SINDH PROVINCIAL ROAD IMPROVEMENT PROJECT (SPRIP)

| FIRM NAME | TECHNICAL EVALUATION | | | | | FINANCIAL EVALUATION | | | COMBINED | RANKING |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------|----------------------|------------------|------------------------------------------|-----------------------|-------------------------------------|------------------|--------------|-------------------------|-----------------|
| | Technical Score Points | Technical Wt. Factor | Technical Points | Firm Proposed Price | Evaluated Total Price | Financial Score Points ¹ | Price Wt. Factor | Price Points | Total Evaluation Points | |
| | 1 | 2 | 3 = 1 x 2 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 = 6 x 7 | 9 = 3 + 8 | |
| M/s Mott MacDonald Limited – United Kingdom – (Lead Firm) In association with: (i) M/s MM Pakistan (Pvt) Ltd – Pakistan | 843.48 | 0.9 | 759.13 | US\$ 2,309,256 (+) PKR 289,255,000 | \$4,409,151 | 907.56 | 0.1 | 90.76 | 849.89 | 2 nd |
| M/s Engineering Consultants International (Private) Limited – Pakistan – (Lead Firm) In association with: (i) M/s Rambøll Danmark A/S – Denmark; and (ii) M/s A A Associates – Pakistan | 895.19 | 0.9 | 805.67 | US\$ 4,949,760 | \$4,433,690 | 902.54 | 0.1 | 90.25 | 895.92 | 1 st |
| M/s Pyunghwa Engineering Consultants Ltd – Korea – (Lead Firm) In a Joint Venture with: (i) M/s National Development Consultants (Pvt) Limited – Pakistan; and (ii) M/s The Korea Transport Institute – Korea | 796.36 | 0.9 | 716.72 | US\$ 2,472,875 (+) PKR 226,096,000 | \$4,001,564 | 1000.00 | 0.1 | 100.00 | 816.72 | 3 rd |

Prepared by: Engr. Prem Chand Talreja

Position: Project Director, PMU, SPRIP-WSD Sindh

Signature:

Date: 20 June 2018

¹ Computed as follows:

$$Sf = 1,000 \times Fm / F$$

where:

Sf - is the financial score of the Financial Proposal being evaluated,

Fm - is the ETP of the lowest priced Financial Proposal,

F - is the ETP of the Financial Proposal under consideration.